University of Zurich[UZH]

Zurich Open Repository and Archive
University of Zurich
University Library
Strickhofstrasse 39
CH-8057 Zurich
www.zora.uzh.ch

Year: 2012

The Renaissance musician and theorist confronted with religious fragmentation: conflict, betrayal and dissimulation

Groote, Inga Mai ; Vendrix, Philippe

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110270051.163

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich
ZORA URL: https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-69946
Book Section
Published Version

Originally published at:
Groote, Inga Mai; Vendrix, Philippe (2012). The Renaissance musician and theorist confronted with religious fragmentation: conflict, betrayal and dissimulation. In: Karremann, Isabel; Zwierlein, Cornel; Groote, Inga Mai. Forgetting Faith? Confessional Negotiations in Early Modern Europe. Berlin etc.: Walter de Gruyter, 163-198.
DOI: https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110270051.163

The Renaissance Musician and Theorist Confronted with Religious Fragmentation: Conflict, Betrayal and Dissimulation

Inga Mai Groote and Philippe Vendrix[1]

Music is a determining element of those cultural practices which serve to constitute and characterise an era. Virtually all the protagonists of the Reformation and the Counter-Reformation devoted a considerable number of pages to the topic of music. Sometimes, indeed, these were pages written by musical connoisseurs of real intelligence and finesse, such as Martin Luther. But there is always a considerable margin that exists between the prescriptiveness of such written discourses and the realities of musical practice. Such discrepancies have often been studied in musicology, to the extent that they allow us to comprehend, in part, the nature of the creative act – 'in part' because, just as there are discrepancies between prescription and reality, so too are there many instances where the relations between composer, work and religious observance evolved with a very real absence of clarity and cogency. And we must remember that this absence, encountered during the greater part of the sixteenth century, stems from a multitude of causes both general and particular. Such causes extend from the nature of music itself, as an immaterial object whose significance can and does vary according to the conditions under which it is performed (that is, according to context and situation), to as far as the extreme complexity of religious and confessional affiliations.

Musical practices could differ following the clear lines of demarcation of the main Catholic-Protestant antagonism, but they differed as well between the internal Protestant factions – Lutherans and Reformed Protestants, with, of course, further differentiations between Calvinists and Zwinglians, and minor movements – while also differing over time, that is, according to chronology. In the first decades after the onset of the Reformation, for example, the dynamics of the situation remained unclear, for as long as the principal denominations had not formulated

1 We would like to thank Philip Weller for his help with the translation.

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

established standards for liturgical practice. In itself, as this summary shows, such a situation brought with it a considerable number of differences, contradictions and various other types of difficulty, which then take on a further dimension of ambivalence when we turn to consider the individual cases themselves.

Examining a case that may stand, emblematically, for the general situation, that of Jacobus Clemens non Papa, will serve to demonstrate some of these difficulties and the general absence of clarity. He was a musician, and one of his first posts was that *succentor* at the cathedral of Bruges. He laid claim, in whatever sense this might have been, to his 'non papal' status in the very formulation of his name. The story is, however, more complex than it might seem at first. Historians have suggested more or less everything in connection with this name (or sobriquet, as we should perhaps call it). Some have seen in it the wish, on the composer's part, to distinguish himself clearly from Pope Clement VII – but the possible reason for this remains entirely mysterious, given that there is really no scarcity of Clements at this period, in the mid-sixteenth century in the Low Countries. Others, with a more pronounced interest in rare names and lesser-known individuals, have thought that the composer may have wanted to distinguish himself from the priest Jacobus Papa, an intellectual and teacher born in Ypres who seems to have been much appreciated and enjoyed a good reputation. Such hypotheses are nevertheless very difficult to argue for convincingly, unsupported as they are by any shred of documentation.

By contrast, another hypothesis which proposes a relation between the name 'non Papa' and a possible manifestation of Protestant sympathies has found a certain justification in material (that is, musical and contextual) evidence. Such evidence includes, for example, the *Missa Ecce quam bonum* which the composer constructed as a parody mass, on the basis of his own motet on the same text. The text is taken from Psalm 133: "Ecce quam bonum et quam iucundum habitare fratres in unum" ('Behold, how good and joyful a thing it is, brethen, to dwell together in unity'), and could very easily, with its radical overtones (see below), have been interpreted by contemporary listeners as an exhortation to religious purity and unanimity. So that, from a merely witty and amusing reading of the name (rather be anything, but the Pope…), historians have proceeded to a much more serious interpretation, implying a clear confessional choice, of which musical compositions may be seen as significant markers. Apart from masses, motets and chansons, he is credited with having been the creator of the *Souterliedekens* (1556–1557), a

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

substantial series of one hundred and fifty-nine vernacular Psalm settings that were published by the well-known Antwerp printer Tielman Susato. Susato required for songs with Dutch texts of a moral and devotional nature that would not corrupt the young, but rather would encourage them to praise God. Clemens died, however, before the Psalm settings could be completed.

The recent discovery of a number of documents allows us to interpret the sobriquet 'non Papa' in a rather different way (Jas 2005). In January 1553 the archduke Maximilian asked Philip III of Croÿ, second son of Philip II, to mediate in an attempt to persuade Clemens to become master of music at his court. Philip III seems nevertheless to have hesitated, because, in May 1553, writing from his castle at Heverlee near Leuven, he answered somewhat unexpectedly with a remarkably negative reply. Clemens, who had been in his father's service and was known to be "fort expert à la musique" ('very skilled and well versed in music'), would not be suited to a position at the archduke's court, he said, because he was not only a "grand yvroygne" but also a "mal vivant", since he was cohabiting with a woman. Our doubts and suspicions increase, too, and on other fronts, as well, when we turn to consider the musical works of Clemens.

In examining the individual case of Clemens non Papa, it has been possible to consider a variety of sources and activities of radically different types: musical compositions, editorial and publishing projects, archival documents, prosopographical studies. And yet, in spite of this thorough investigation, we only arrived at a new doubtful point that renewed our questions, for no clear affirmation appeared possible. Every assertion, every affirmative statement seems incapable of resisting the various criticisms and contrary points of view. Clemens, thus, appears as both a Catholic and a Protestant, as debauched and also – religiously and artistically – inspired. It would have been more conclusive, of course, under the circumstances, to have had some kind of statement from the composer himself!

In fact, there are very few extant autobiographical statements by musicians which allow us to draw clear conclusions concerning their personal beliefs and convictions. But the close connection between religious consciousness, professional ethos and affective or psychological involvement may in some cases be detected through circumstantial evidence. The Passau schoolmaster and composer Leonhard Paminger (1495–1567) can be cited as a case in point: he recorded a dream in which Martin Luther visited him at home, they ate and prayed together, and, before leaving, Lu-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

ther encouraged Paminger to continue on his path and in his duties (Gürsching 1950). The fact that Paminger is visited specifically and personally by 'his' reformer indicates a strong emotional link, attesting that Paminger evidently supported Luther, and the Lutheran position generally. In reality they exchanged letters, Paminger sent his sons to study in Wittenberg and even mentions certain compositions of his own written at Luther's request – but they never met in person, face to face.

The biographical anecdote about his dream was of course intended to have remained within an entirely private context. Paminger's professional situation would not have allowed him to make it public: he worked as schoolmaster at St. Nikola in Passau, which – notwithstanding the temporary emergence of strong Reformation currents among the inhabitants – remained the residence of a Catholic bishop; and although Bishop Wolfgang von Salm (1514–1555) had applied a moderate degree of tolerance, his successor Urban von Trenbach (1525–1598), by contrast, insisted on applying the regulations promulgated by the Peace of Augsburg. Paminger exchanged his position as rector of the school for that of secretary to the St. Nikola monastery – a professional move which was probably made as a reaction to the intensified surveillance of doctrinal obedience by the new bishop. Paminger's contacts with Luther date from at least 1538, but significantly, all the other documents that allow us to recognize Leonhard Paminger as a follower of the Lutheran Reform – especially pamphlets in rhymed verse on certain theological questions – were published only in the year of his death, by his son.

Every attempt at generalisation hence seems doomed to failure. No life or career, no biographical trajectory, whether personal or professional, exactly resembles another. And yet this difficulty should not appear an insuperable obstacle to the activity of the historian; for it is out of these varied career paths and situations (and the discourses and commentaries which accompany them), that, when we do not insist on the systematic applicability of such dualities and paired catgeories (Protestant / Catholic, declarative / secretive etc.), a picture of sixteenth-century musical life emerges, which accounts for the very real complexity to be found in the sources. We shall set out to illustrate this complexity in addressing three thematic areas: individual situations and strategies; musical signs and markers; theoretical conditions in their relation to confessional factors.

The question to which we shall attempt to find an answer is in truth a double one: during the sixteenth century, were musicians able, or even forced, to hide their faith, to forget or to neglect their private, interior

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

religious beliefs? We shall examine a certain number of musicians' lives, intentionally limiting our enquiries as we do so to certain particular cases (any attempt at comprehensiveness would be self-defeating), as a way of addressing, in specific terms, a second question: what kind of aesthetic response, or what kind of aesthetic expression, might such musicians have been able to give to such shifts and changes (or indeed feignings) of allegiance or conviction?

We shall proceed in a reverse direction, from those cases and factors that are most resistant to interpretation to those that are more easily readable and accessible to scrutiny. In other words, we shall go from considering the musical score, which reveals its secrets only with great difficulty (whether we attempt to place ourselves in the position of the creator or of the receiver, of the listening audience), to concluding with an examination of the theoretical texts that deal with the musical creative act, whose meaning is clearer and more directly accessible to us. In so doing, we remain very conscious of the limits and indeed of the incompleteness of our study. It is, however, this very incompleteness that provides an eloquent testimony of the extreme difficulty in grasping and coming to terms with the historical oblivion into which so many factors of this kind have fallen, and which is also the case with the range and multiplicity of their implications.

1. Individual Musicians' Strategies and Trajectories

The career of a musician in the sixteenth century, like so many others, of necessity oscillates constantly between individual strategy, on the one hand, and socio-professional constraints, on the other. And yet the interrelation of these two lines takes on a special character, a special configuration, in the case we are concerned with here. Such is the difference in the conditions of each musician's career and his (professional and personal) situation that we shall find it is difficult, once again, to set up clear categories. In order to demonstrate this, we shall examine four different cases. The first is that of the French singer and cleric Jeannet de Bouchefort, which ideally illustrates the importance of changes of loyalty and strategies of allegiance towards patrons, within given situations, and how questions of inclusion and exclusion might have operated under such circumstances. The second case, that of the French musician Paschal de L'Estocart, seems to plunge us directly into the very centre of the quicksands of religious consciousness during these crucial years; while

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

the third, that of the German composer Ludwig Daser, manifests a spirit of strong-minded self-determination. Finally, with Leonhard Lechner, we shall be able to follow the trajectory of a musician who is clearly guided by the impetus of his faith, rather than by personal and professional ambitions.

Jeannet de Bouchefort (fl. 1530–1574), a cleric of the diocese of Tournai, was a 'valet de garde-robe' of François I from 1530 to 1533 (on Jeannet de Bouchefort, see Nugent 1990, 244, 248 f., and Cazaux 2002, 141–144, 149 f., 178 f., 344–346). He composed two chansons for four voices published by Attaignant in 1530 (RISM 1530/4). From 1533, he was 'valet de chambre' to the King, along with another young singer called Simon de Faugères. The role of valet de chambre was a position usually taken by non-aristocratic individuals who had enjoyed the King's patronage and generosity, thanks to the proximity to the ruler. During the night of 17–18 October 1534, many anti-Catholic messages and slogans were posted in Paris, Blois, Tours, Orléans (the so-called *Affaire des placards*). One of them was even posted on the door of King François I's room in his *château* at Amboise. These messages made clear statements against the abuses of the papal mass and the Catholic concept of the Eucharist. After this event, François I stopped protecting the Protestants. He was forced to affirm publicly his belief in the Catholic faith and to persecute some of the eminent Protestant leaders. Clément Marot and Jeannet de Bouchefort were both expelled from the kingdom, as the *Cronique du roy François* attests, since they had overtly and publicly expressed their religious dissent.

They found a place of political asylum in Ferrara, at the court of the Duchess Renée de France (daughter of Louis XII, sister-in-law of François I, and wife of Ercole II d'Este). Here, the duchess maintained a circle of numerous men of letters (and women, too), humanists, philosophers and scholars who discussed the main aspects and tendencies of Protestant thought: Leon Jamet, Pier Paolo Vergerio, Giovanni Senf/Sinapio, Marcello Palingenio Stellato, Chilian Senf/Sinapio, Celio Secondo Curione, Fulvio Peregrino Morato, Olimpia Morata, Bernardino Ochino, and others. No less a figure than Clément Marot was also hired as personal secretary to the duchess. Jeannet arrived at the d'Este court in May 1535. He was hired as a singer by duke Ercole II d'Este, and received onto the staff of his court chapel. Archival documents present him as "Zanetto francese", paid with a good salary of 20 lire marchesane (the same salary as the maestro di cappella, Maistre Jhan, who had recently held this position: see Nugent 1990).

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

In this period the ducal chapel was composed of fourteen or fifteen singers: eight of these were of Franco-Flemish origin; but, with the exception of Jeannet de Bouchefort, for none of them is there currently any evidence of a possible involvement in the Protestant circle of Renée de France. In any case, the religious climate of Ferrara appeared to contemporaries as a potentially fertile place for Lutherans or Lutheran sympathisers, as the humanist Battista Stabellino, alias Demogorgon, wrote to the marchesa Isabella d'Este:

> […] in questo medesimo tempo che questi signori si dava zoia e diletto, in la terra si faceva una bella processione con tutte le regole de frati e preti; et alla croce grande che si porta in processione inanzi al clero, vi era attaccata una gran bolla papale, cosa che non è solito farsi, e questa si dice esser per la crociata per cavare denari per andare contro il turco o contra Siena, ma ben vi so dire che di qua cavarà poco argento, perché da noi non si crede molto a queste cose ecclesiastiche e credo non abbia a passar molto di tempo, che saren tutti lutterani e crederemo più presto alla fede maomettana, et alla legge del turco, che alla fede de preti (ASMN, Archivio Gonzaga, B. 1250, Ferrara 23 marzo 1531; cf. Fontana 1889–1899, I).

That even some Ferrarese courtiers fashioned themselves willingly as less orthodox believers, certainly as much less overtly conventional in their allegiance to the church ("perché da noi non si crede molto a queste cose ecclesiastiche"), can be deduced from Stabellino's report. He draws a clear distinction between the micro-society participating in a courtly festivity and a public procession led by friars in the 'outside world' beyond the court with the express aim of collecting money for a crusade; and he underlines the attitude of relative indifference towards the church by remarking that the friars would have raised very little money from the courtiers. He even goes so far as to remark that they evidently cared much less about church affairs, and would more likely become Lutherans or believe "in the faith of the Mahometans" than in "the faith of the priests". This displays a remarkable insouciance, amounting almost to an expression of heresy – at least in a literal sense – which we may find astonishing in such a context, at this historical juncture.

Jeannet de Bouchefort made his Protestant tendencies clearly known when on 14 April 1536, during the Good Friday procession, he refused to venerate the crucifix, in a city church of Ferrara, in front of the whole Este court and the French group from Renée's entourage. He went so far as to walk out of the service. Jean Calvin himself had arrived clandestinely in Ferrara on 23 March 1536 disguised under the pseudonym Carlo d'Espeville (Espeville is a village near Noyon). In an extant letter,

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

duke Ercole II described this event to his ambassador at the court of François I, Girolamo Feruffini, as follows:

> […] Sono circa XI. o XII mesi, che capitò qua un Gianetto francese cantore, el qual a, complacentia de la S^ra^ Duchessa nostra consorte fussimo contento pigliare a nostro servitio, con questo però chel attendesse a vivere bene et christianamente, et questo perché intendevemo, che da questo Regno di Francia era fuggito per imputatione d'essere lutherano, et che un suo compagno era stato arrestato per ordine del Re. Hora essendone accostato qua, con un Clemente Marotto, et con alcuni altri, pur venuti di là, et essendosi mormorato molto qua de la non christiana vita che tenevano, et fattone ancho querela presso noi, oltra che da nostri avvisi havuti di Roma eravamo stati avvertiti a provvedere che simili heretici non stessero nel nostro stato pur perché non vedevamo cose molto enorme, et ci piaceva la sua virtù, oltra al affetto che portavemo per respetto de la natione. Desideravemo cha la cosa non procedesse più oltra et lui si trovasse senza colpa, ma essendo occorso chel venerdì santo, havendo noi fatto cantar qui in una chiesa il pascio et essendo ogniuno secondo il costume andato ad adorare la croce el predetto Giannetto, non solo non vi andò, ma per quanto da molti ne fu referto, si partì con demostrare di dispregiare et di tener [poco] conto de la fede di Christo, et essendo pervenuto ciò a notitia del Rev^mo^ Inquisitore […] fussimo astretto, per l'honore di Dio, et per la Justitia darlo [ne le mani] de la ragione […] (ASMo, Cancelleria ducale, Minute dei dispacci di Francia, b. 41, Ercole II a Girolamo Feruffini, 5 maggio 1536, cf. Fontana 1889–1899, I, 318 f.).

Jeannet was tried and given a hearing at a session of the Inquisition before being arrested (as indeed were other supposed heretics as well). Renée of France obtained a papal brief ('breve apostolico') in order to allow her French friends to escape and return to France. But the duke refused to hand over Jeannet to the governor of Bologna. Renée asked the King of France, François I, to request the Estense ambassador Feruffini to persuade the duke of Ferrara to free Jeannet and the others – and they were eventually freed under the protection of Georges d'Armagnac. Only in July 1536, thanks to the Edict of Coucy, were the suspected heretics finally authorized to return to France, on the condition that they abjured their religious errors. Jeannet officially did so, and returned to the chapel of the king in 1537, continuing to serve as an evidently talented and much respected singer (considering his salary and the gifts of the King), and working as a royal valet de chambre until 1574 (Cazeaux 2002 and Handy 2008).

The career of Paschal de L'Estocart is poorly documented, and the few elements of documentation that have come down to us demand the greatest prudence in interpretation, given that they can appear to sug-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

gest such contradictory points of view (for details cf. Cœurdevey / Besson 2004). He was born in Noyon, in Picardy, around 1537, but we know nothing of his early musical training. The first traces of his activity are to be found at Lyons in 1559, and then again in 1565. After this, there is nothing recorded at all for nearly fifteen years. At this point (1581), L'Estocart can be found at the university in Basel, where he counted among his colleagues the poet Jean de Sponde and the sons of the Reformed pastor Antoine de La Roche-Chandieu – author (along with another pastor, Simon Goulart, and the doctor Joseph Du Chesne, two other well-known Huguenots) of most of the *Octonaires de la vanité du monde.* The *Octonaires* were an extensive collection of spiritual eight-line strophes (*huitains*), set to music by Claude le Jeune and La Roche-Chandieu himself (His 2000). We can only suppose that it was because of his sympathy for the ideas of the Reformation that L'Estocart settled in Calvinist territory and also published his works there. His output comprises four published cycles, all issued in 1582 by the Lyon bookseller Barthélemy Vincent, and doubtless also in Geneva (where they were printed by Jean II de Laon): the *Cent vingt et six Quatrains du Sieur de Pibrac*, the first and second book of the *Octonaires*, the *Cent cinquante Pseaumes de David*, and the *Sacrae Cantiones.*

The final phase of L'Estocart's career is as mysterious as its beginning. Only two dates stand out clearly: the first – 1584 – is when he appears as one of the prizewinners at the Puy d'Evreux (the polyphonic competition held at Evreux, under the holy patronage of St. Cecilia). The second is in 1587, when he appears on a list of petitioners submitted to Henry III, asking for a lay position at the abbey of Frémont (this was rejected). Could it be that he converted back to Catholicism, or even (perhaps) that he never fully embraced Calvinism? This apparent duality is clearly reflected in the printed collection of *Sacrae cantiones*, with its dedication to Count Palatine Johann Casimir – a well-known Calvinist during the Wars of Religion – on the one hand, and, on the other, its Latin-texted pieces. These comprise only eight compositions, of diverse origin: an *Agnus Dei*; a respond from the Office of the Dead (*Peccantem me quotidie*); two poems of a Christian humanist character (*Quos anguis dirus* and *Ut tibi mors foelix*); a kind of antiphon-like text not actually found in any known liturgical context (*Hodie Christus servator*); an extract from the Gospel according to Matthew (*Angelus autem*); and, finally, a piece in honour of John the Baptist, also taken from the New Testament (*Inter natos mulierum*).

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

The French-texted pieces are all examples of the *chanson spirituelle.* With these works, the listener is immediately plunged deep into the Calvinist universe. As the ideas of the Reformers were affecting larger and larger parts of France, the need was felt for a musical medium which, while not breaking with musical habits and traditions that were ingrained and familiar, would furnish a means of conveying texts and ideas of a religious nature. Thus we find the emergence of these *chansons spirituelles*, which are sacred *contrafacta* of secular chansons that became extraordinarily widely distributed. Here, poetic texts judged to be unsuitable were replaced by virtuous texts expressing flawless morality and devotion. In a second phase of such activity, new forms that were specifically Protestant in form and intention began to appear. On the one hand, the famous collections of the *Psaumes de David* in the translation by Clément Marot and Théodore de Bèze; and, on the other, all the new repertoire of the Protestant *chansons spirituelles* (newly composed in both text and music). These two genres are both present in L'Estocart's *Sacrae Cantiones.*

With such a musical production to his name, we should surely not be very surprised at Henri III's refusal. And yet, at the same time, it seems that L'Estocart may well have had good reason to make the request. Had he not just distinguished himself at the arch-Catholic competition of the Puy d'Evreux? There was no longer any possibility of his being able to hide his sympathies – for even if his musical publications did not enjoy an immense success, they could hardly have gone unnoticed. Was L'Estocart perhaps disappointed with his Calvinist friends? Did he sense the need for a return to the Catholicism in which he had been born and brought up in Picardy? And was the possibility of such a return also maybe linked to questions of material comfort and security, of which he seems visibly to have been deprived? No document has survived which would permit even the most tentative of hypotheses in respect to this group of questions.

The case of Ludwig Daser (c. 1526–1589) forces us to take an investigative step in the direction of the idea of dissimulation. Daser began his career in musical service at the court of Bavaria, and, like the majority of the chapel singers, had a solid education in both music and theology. He was an ordained priest, and was well able to aspire to the position and functions of ducal *Kapellmeister.* And although he never attained the dignity of chaplain, Albrecht V granted to him and to Matthieu Le Maistre the co-directorship of the ducal chapel. In 1554, Le Maistre left Munich to join the Protestant chapel of the Prince Elector of Saxony. Daser thus found himself in charge alone of a very remarkable musical ensemble, for

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

which he composed a great deal. Daser's energy and development were, however, dealt a severe blow with the appointment in 1556 of another musician, Roland de Lassus. The praise accorded Lassus was unanimous. And so, perhaps understandably, Daser took offence at this, suffered from it even, and although he temporarily recovered his poise – in the long term seems not to have been able to tolerate the secondary role to which Lassus's presence constrained him. By chance, Duke Ludwig of Württemberg was on the lookout, in 1571, for a new Cantor for his chapel. Daser did not hesitate: in 1572, he settled in Stuttgart and set out, with a display of real talent and aplomb, to oversee the musical destiny of the ducal chapel. He then converted to Protestantism, while still keeping a pension granted him (for life) by the Bavarian court.

Even as a priest, Daser had harboured (and to some extent manifested) clear affinities for Lutheranism even during his Munich years. It is true that we have no direct expression or testimony of such sympathies in documentary form. The only undeniable indication is a clear textual feature in the Credo of the *Missa Ave Maria* which Daser wrote while still working at the Bavarian court. The text is augmented with an additional "nostrum" – at the confession of faith marking the figure of Christ as the second member of the Trinity, we now read: "et in unum Dominum nostrum Jesum Christum". This 'nostrification' of the text marks, with a kind of Protestant seal, a work which the composer obviously destined for the arch-Catholic court of Munich, where it could have escaped nobody's notice.

Did Daser leave Munich for professional reasons? Or for reasons of belief and religious conviction? For both, no doubt. He had had the temerity to announce his allegiances in the *Missa Ave Maria.* And he had also without doubt profited from the tolerance of the duke, who seems to have applied the well-known proverb "Qui nescit dissimulare, nescit regnare" ('Who knows not how to conceal, knows not how to govern'), which Luther himself cited on several occasions, both in his *Tischreden* and in his lectures. He considers dissimulation – in the sense of a tolerant or forbearing attitude – as a practice necessary to the governance of a house, a dynasty, a city: necessary, because of human imperfection.

There was a general awareness of the ideas (and practices) of 'simulation' and of 'dissimulation'. The definition of dissimulation came from the tradition of canon law and Roman law. Ecclesiastical authorities would 'dissimulate' by pretending not to have seen certain abuses or errors, while still reserving the right to intervene at some future stage. In the field of politics, by extension, a ruling prince would 'dissimulate' in order

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

to be able to achieve his ends in a clear and practical way, and to avoid being caught in a difficult or unresolvable situation. He had to give the appearance of not knowing certain things in order not to compromise his authority and his ability to govern, and (above all) to support and reinforce the reality of his power.

The career of Leonhard Lechner (c. 1553–1606) seems to have been guided more by his faith than by purely professional factors. As a choirboy, he was a member of the Bavarian court chapel under Lassus. He then converted to Lutheranism at an early age, and held a subordinate post as assistant schoolmaster in Nuremberg around 1575. He left this position in search of further career opportunities, finding employment at the Catholic court of Hechingen (where Count Eitelfriedrich IV of Hohenzollern-Hechingen had employed other Protestant musicians before him, notably Jacob Meiland). Lechner seems to have obtained some kind of guarantee that he could attend religious services elsewhere (probably in the neighbouring territory of Württemberg, where Protestants from Hechingen also had to be buried), as we find mentioned in his funeral oration by Erasmus Grüninger: "wann er ja seiner kunst halben unter dem papsttumb etwa seine gelegenheit suchen müssen, er doch ihme die religion, und das exercitium deroselben anderswo zu besuchen, austruckenlich bevor behalten" (cit. Schmid 1962, 192).

The funeral oration also presents us with a rather picturesque statement giving details of his conversion, which came about for reasons of conscience: "nach dem er gemercket, er werde bey der römischen kirchen […] nicht mögen in den himmel kommen" (Schmid 1962, 186) – but of course, we should remember that this sermon was specifically intended for a Protestant audience. Nonetheless, personal conflicts between the self-confident *Kapellmeister* and his employer (and most probably also a variety of counter-reformation reprisals and other disciplinary measures undertaken by the duke) ensured that Lechner soon began to search for another position. Count Eitelfriedrich made available a generous endowment in 1584 so as to enable students of (Catholic) theology to pursue their studies, in order to combat the spread of Protestant heresy, which was described as: "heftig herfürbrechen un heyllosiglich einreissen der verführerischen, verdambten ketzereyen, als Lutherischen, Calvinischen, Zwinglischen und dergleichen mehr abergläubischen religionssekten" (cit. Schmid 1962, 314).

In 1585, Lechner applied – unsuccessfully – for a post at the Dresden court, and addressed a motet to duke August of Saxony, with a text including the line "Vive columna diu syncerae relligionis" (Schmid 1962,

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

200) as a specimen composition: this might well be read as an expression of his support for the Protestant cause (but equally, of course, it can also be interpreted simply as an appropriate way of addressing to a secular ruler of this religious confession). Lechner then fled to Tübingen in Württemberg, one of the most stable Protestant territories, where he gained the support of Duke Ludwig, who secured him a post as tenor singer in the Württemberg court chapel choir. Notwithstanding the scarcity of sources relating to clearly confessional questions, Lechner's case in its entirety could plausibly be interpreted as that of a musician with a strong personal religious commitment, whose sense of conviction forbade a second conversion simply in order to secure his professional position and employment.

As seems clear from the few examples we have been able to examine here in some detail, religious 'conversions' (even if the term itself did not yet exist in this sense) of musicians may often have been based on a combination of motives. They may at times have been not primarily an expression of a personal belief, but of contextual and to that extent extrinsic interests. At least from the point at which recognized denominations had been established, and of course if the legal framework permitted (as was the case in a Catholic-Protestant 'bi-confessional' city such as Augsburg), confessional allegiance could be switched for a variety of reasons – and such decisions were even reversible (cf. Breuer 1999, 62 f., for a statistical survey from Augsburg).

Examples from the seventeenth century demonstrate quite clearly that conversion could be motivated by economic or social interests, for example to open the way to obtaining a position or to protect possessions against claims by kinship (Volland 2003). This may have been less current for the sixteenth century, when the situation was still much less clear and adherence to a newly formed religious 'protest movement' could easily constitute a far greater social and personal risk. For music, a practice of what we might think of as 'pragmatic oblivion' is indicated by an expert judgement issued by the theological faculty of the University of Wittenberg in 1597: when asked if a Lutheran ruler could maintain Catholic musicians in his service, the faculty answered that they should be tolerated initially, but that the court preacher should try to convince them of the error of their ways, and then, only if these attempts proved useless, that they should be dismissed, to be finally replaced by Protestants who (as a result of the Protestant educational system) would be at hand in sufficient numbers:

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

> Ob ein Christlicher Fürst päbstische Musicanten halten dürfe? […] daß unter den Musicanten einer angenommen / so der Päpstischen Religion zugethan / welcher gleichwol alle Christl. Gesänge / Lateinische und deutsche / wie ihm dieselbigen von Capellmeistern auffgegeben werden in seiner Summe unbeschweret mit verrichten / […] Jedoch soll dieses […] ferner nicht gezogen werden / als so lange und alldieweil sich gedachter Cantor und die andere Päbstischen Hoffdiener […] inmittelst die Warheit nicht lästern / und nicht andere neben sich verführen […] wenn alle Mittel an ihnen verlohren […] an ihre Stadt Rechtgläubige / deren bey den Reformirten Kirchen und Schulen / Gott lob kein Mangel / sondern ein erwünscheter Vorrath ist zu diesem befodert werden (*Consilia theologica* 1664, 60 f.).

This demonstrates clearly that, for some considerable period of time, cross-confessional employment would not be seen as an obstacle, especially if the individual in question did not in any way disturb public order. Only if he proved obdurate, and persevered in his 'error', would sanctions be imposed. Regulations of this kind (if codified at all) would at the same time leave enough flexibility and liberty of action for musicians to pursue their professional interests under a variety of conditions.

We have all too little evidence of the kinds of personal risks incurred by musicians. The only recorded case of a musician being investigated by the Inquisition, that of Damian a Goes, mentions music only in order to add a further element to the list of 'bad habits' acquired by this Protestant sympathiser. Krystof Harant, baron of Polzice and Bezdruzice (1564–1621), presents another interesting case. After studies completed at the court of Archduke Ferdinand at Innsbruck, he fought against the Turks (1597) and made a pilgrimage to the Holy Land. An advisor and counsellor to Rudolf II (1600), he took sides with the Reformers and was in command of the Protestant armies at the battle of White Mountain (Bilá Hora in the Czech realm; 8 November 1620), and was then executed along with twenty other prominent rebels on the great central square in Prague. A polymath and Renaissance humanist, and, at the same time, an indefatigable traveller, a seasoned man of letters, an engineer and an army commander, a singer and a choral director, Krystof Harant was not condemned for his Mass setting (the *Missa quinis vocibus super dolorosi martyr*) or his motets (*Maria Kron, Qui confidunt)*, all of which were composed in the purest imaginable Venetian style of the later sixteenth century, but for his acts of rebellion and revolt. We would have to turn to other cases – Jews who had converted to Christianity, for example – to find a clearer and more useful method of measuring the kind and degree of risk that a musician might run who had decided to conceal his true religious beliefs and allegiances (Harrán 2003).

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

2. Musical Markers of Confessional Allegiance

Music can fulfil different functions. Its use in the liturgy is defined by the principles established for worship; it can be used in private contexts as a means of devotion, and it can serve as a cultural sign to mark personal or group identity in public contexts. In all such cases, the use of music and the message of its text are decisive for conveying its full significance, though this is not usually true of the technical structure of the piece. Certain musical genres tend to oscillate between the secular and the sacred sphere. They may take their impetus and significance from either one or the other, or indeed from both. This is true, in an exemplary way, for the polyphonic motet, right from the time of its origins in the Middle Ages. In the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, the motet could employ liturgical or nonliturgical texts across an astonishingly wide range. Its character could have arisen from liturgical or paraliturgical considerations, as we may judge from its extreme liberty and diversity of musical style (a freedom which of course does not preclude various obligations and constraints in the realm of compositional *écriture*, above all when the motet is constructed using plainchant materials, for example), and from its freedom of function (which is normally not the case for explicitly liturgical works). Such flexibility in the case of the motet makes of it a genre especially well adapted to expressions of power, of political representation, of religious conviction.

Particular types of the motet indeed form a kind of sub-category which specifically emphasizes the relations existing between such motets and the domain of political power: this is true for example of the so-called 'Staatsmotette' (Dunning 1970). Music destined to function as an element of the representation of power, in celebrating (for instance) a princely coronation or some other important political event, will almost always be composed on a Latin text written specially for the occasion. At one extreme, one could be content simply to add to a liturgical text a phrase of formula referring to the persons or circumstances involved in the celebration; more often, a man of letters would be commissioned to write a versified Latin text specifically for the occasion, in which the whole gamut of themes and references to power and authority – both sacred and secular – would typically appear. A composer might even set out to evoke the complexity of a given situation musically. The case of Loyset Compère (c. 1445–1518) demonstrates this clearly, when he proceeds to compose his cantus firmus motet *Sola caret monstris si Gallia / Fera pessima*, based on a text of markedly political character. It reads like a pamph-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

let of extreme violence directed against the Pope (Dean 1986). The words of the motet criticise the Pope directly and openly:

> 'Sola caret monstris si Gallia, cur modo, Juli,
> dentibus hoc nostrum torquet fera pessima regnum?'
> rex ait, et 'Deus est pro nobis, Francia vincet…'
> Tu fera pessima; tu frigus pluviasque nivesque
> Congeris in clerum populumque; sed ibis ut umbra.[2]

This strongly expressed critique is reinforced by the character and message of the cantus firmus, constructed on a repeated chant motif, to a text that is quite explicit in its point of focus: *Fera pessima devoravit* – 'A horrible, ferocious beast has devoured'!

The motet *Laetamini in Domino* by Philippe Verdelot (c. 1470/1480 – c. 1552) offers a very clear and useful example of a 'political' motet with religious implications. Composed for six voices, it divides its vocal forces clearly between a group of four, which unfold in a classically contrapuntal texture, and a pair of voices (Tenor and Quintus), which are constructed as a paired canonic ostinato that has its own text: "*Ecce quam bonum et quam iocundum habitare fratres in unum*" (Psalm 133). In Florence, this phrase served as a 'rallying cry' to the followers of Savonarola (while in 1530, Ludwig Senfl's motet on the same Psalm text opened the Diet of Regensburg as an exhortation to unity). Verdelot knows this, and accentuates this connotative aspect of the text by giving the canonic pairing a melodic turn which is clearly evocative of the *lauda*, the penitential-devotional songs favoured by the Savonarolans. Adrian Willaert also makes allusion to Savonarola in his motet *Recordare Domine.* There are three explicit allusions: firstly, in the bassus (mm. 183–185) there is a citation of the antiphon *Ecce quam bonum* as it is transmitted in Tuscan sources; then, there are allusions to the Josquin *Miserere* (mm. 191–197); and finally, the text beginning at m. 178 with the words "et ne in aeternum obliviscaris nostri" ("and for eternity, do not forget us"), doubtless an allusion directed towards the memory of Savonarola himself.

These last two examples urgently raise the question of the range of reference for such citations. Is it possible (we may wonder) for any Savonarolan partisan to perceive allusions of this kind in such complex music

2 While France alone is free of monsters, why then, Julius, does this horrible wild beast tear our kingdom to pieces with its teeth? Thus spoke the king: God is on our side: France shall win the victory. You are that horrible ferocious beast, you bring down the cold, the rain and the snow upon the Church and the people – but you shall go hence like a shadow.

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

by Verdelot or Willaert? The dense contrapuntal textures of these two motets would certainly constitute a formidable obstacle to any sympathiser who might be expected to identify such a form of 'Savonarolan' reference, manifested by so brief a citation. In a similar vein, we saw in the case of L'Estocart how difficult it is to understanding the thorny question of *contrafacta*, of melodic borrowings designed to facilitate the circulation and dissemination of ideas (Freedman 2000, Cœurdevey 2003).

Concerning liturgical contexts, the discussions centered around the correct type of musical practice and choice of repertory. One major factor was the introduction by the Protestant Reformers of congregational singing in the vernacular as an integral part of their form of service (Pettegree 2005, 40 ff.). But again, such an apparently cohesive development could easily result (at the level of detail) in very different musical practices. Lutherans, for instance, adapted catechetic texts, sometimes set to already well-known song melodies as a means of reinforcing religious instruction (Leaver 2007, 166–170); the Reformed limited the texts to be sung more strictly to biblical sources and thus created mostly simple settings of vernacular psalms (such as the aforementioned *Souterliedekens*). Parallel to this, discussions continued as to whether the practice of Latin polyphony could be maintained, or whether it had to be abandoned because it was suspected of being 'Papist'. But as the Wittenberg Reformation explicitly favoured the institution of church choirs (like the *Kantorei* established by Johann Walter at Torgau), and already had at its disposal a vast repertory – the printer Georg Rhau issued a whole series of musical prints with polyphonic works adapted to the needs of the Protestant liturgy and targeted at the Lutheran regions – the Lutherans could easily follow a model of their own for a renewed type of polyphonic choral liturgical practice (the use of the organ, however, was viewed more critically, even by Luther himself). The best-known *locus* within the Lutheran tradition for defending polyphony against the suspicion that it might be 'Papist', is the so-called "Verba des alten Johan Walthers" (Observations of the old Johann Walter):

> weil ich sehe und erfahre, daß diese Kunst Musica von vielen, die sich Evangelisch und Lutherisch rühmen, verkleinert und veracht wird: vermeinen, es sei Papistisch, so man in Christlicher Gemeine und bei Göttlichen Amten vier- oder fünfstimmigen Gesang gebrauche, und als wollte man damit das Papsttum stärken, so die Musica im Figuralgesang gefördert werde, und heißens etliche Katzengebeiße, ein Ochsengeschrei, ein Geplärre und ein Anreizung zur Unzucht und dergleichen (Praetorius 1615, 451).

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

Certain polemical reactions against Protestant congregational singing show the very real importance of music for determining confessional identity: numerous prohibitions of vernacular songs are attested in such different places as Salzburg or Basel (Lindmayr-Brandl 2005, 90 f.; Marcus 2005, 169–171). Some Catholics from Basel – like the professor Bonifacius Amerbach, or the Carthusian Georgius Carpentarii – mocked the local Protestants specifically on the basis of their singing, describing their chorales as rude and "wailing": "plebs […] psalmos, hosque in germanicam linguam versos, ululat" (Amerbach), or "[…] ceperunt Lutherani […] psalmos rhithmicos, in lingua vernacula […] invitis magistratibus laico more cantilenarum, sed satis incondito, in templo sancti Martini decantare" (Carpentarii; cited from Marcus 2005, 165).

A similar degree of tension and conflict can also be observed in anti-Catholic warnings against musical practices within the Mass. Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt was a central figure of the Wittenberg events of 1521–1522, when he tried to introduce a more radical type of Reformation. In the polemical theses contained in his *De cantu gregoriano* (1521–1522), he criticises Catholic musical habits and usage: Gregorian chant does not promote sincere and devout prayer (for his theological position, interior spiritual prayer is of central importance), and polyphony may even be an obstacle to devotion (text in Barge 1905, vol. 1, 491–493). In a more critical and parodic spirit, this same question – how far and to what extent does music help devotion? – is posed by the Berne reformer and playwright Niclaus Manuel in his play *Vom Papst und seiner Priesterschaft* (1524), where one of the figures heads for the church to buy an indulgence and is attracted by organ music and singing (probably plainchant), which makes him sweat with devotion: "Gen Bern ich in die Kilchen vast trang; / Da hort ich orgelen und wol singen, / und fing an mit macht fürhin ze tringen / In unser frowen capelen dört vor, / die stat uf der rechten siten am chor. / Ich fieng glich an von andacht schwitzen. […]" (Baechtold 1878, 73). Serious texts also admonished Protestants who could not avoid attending Mass that they should be careful to ignore the singing and playing of instruments ("das du auff den manigfeltigen mißbrauch / der da gehalten wirdt in singen / klingen / pfeyffen / orgeln / oder was das geschicht anders dann Christus auffgesetzt hat / kain auffmercken habest"), and instead concentrate on spiritual prayer (Reinhart 1524).

In summarising the message and import of these sources, we can conclude that Catholic identity is strongly associated with organ playing, while vocal polyphony – at least for Lutherans – was much less ideolog-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

ically charged; but in any case, the importance of vernacular songs, as a means of participation in the liturgy and a way of being fully involved, were strongly supported by the reformers. On this basis, the public use of hymns and chorales was a clear marker of confessional identity; but it could nevertheless include polemical content as well, if the texts contained political and anti-Catholic sentiment (perhaps the most famous example being "Erhalt uns, Herr, bei deinem Wort / Und steur des Papsts und Türken Mord"; cf. Wagner Oettinger 2001, 191 f.). A solution to these tension seemed to come closer only when the status of *adiaphora* was accepted for musical practice (cf. Irwin 1983); but nevertheless, the treatment of music remained linked to a clear notion of confessional identity and allegiance. Polyphony itself only rarely reached the level of direct polemic, as in the well known motet *Te Lutherum damnamus* (which can be read as an application of the stately tradition of polyphonic *Te Deum* settings for expressing the anathema against Luther) or in the notion of polyphony opposed to a vilifying depiction of Catholic clerics, with the piece *Beatus vir qui abiit in consilio* on Pancratius Kempff's *Des Interims und der Interimisten warhafftig abgemalte figur* 1548 (Pietschmann 2005). However, in any case, a generally accepted and direct correlation between musical style and confessional allegiance must be strongly denied – the repertoires that were in use in many Lutheran centres in fact comprised a quantity of Latin-texted polyphony and older repertory, as well as works by contemporary Catholic composers.

3. Theoretical Paradigms and Confessional Perspectives

The concept of music finds another form of expression in theoretical – and also in pedagogical – writings on music. Parallel to observations made on the practice of music, in texts of a more theoretical kind, there are also connections to be made between confessional interests and theoretical positionings within the larger field of music – although this topic has (of necessity) to be considered as the history of an at least partial failure of the search for unequivocal meanings. Even if, in the theoretical discourse on music, charges of this kind can be observed, in many cases a study of the more detailed reception history indicates a process of change and diversification which seems to constitute an evasion: many of these statements could be interpreted as indicators of a willing neglect of questions of faith, in favour of other attitudes towards musical compositions and their intrinsic aesthetic values. Among these

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

other approaches, a growing interest in the affective and emotional powers of music (and of particular pieces) may be seen as one of the prevailing characteristics.

This discourse is – at least in German-speaking territories from the second quarter of the sixteenth century onwards – closely linked with the representative of another professional group: the cantor. A partially complementary figure to the composer and musician in musical life, the teacher and theorist developed as the "Kantor" a specific professional profile. These persons were members of the teachers' body at local schools (Lateinschulen) and responsible for teaching grammar and other subjects as well as music (mostly preparing the school-boys for their singing duties in the services); they were required to have completed their university studies and thus represented the strong link between music and general education in the Protestant school system (Niemöller 1969). They often composed music for local needs and authored textbooks – for music as well as for the other subjects they were expected to teach. Even on the level of introductory writings on music it is possible to observe the effects of liturgical changes. For example, if a reformed liturgy maintained the use of polyphony, or not, the music text books in use locally could include mensural notation, or not, as the situation demanded. The cantors could base their self-conception on the comprehensive system of learning underpinning every religious education. Thus the main corpus of texts stems from a well-defined confessional context; in how far this actually results in characteristic traits has yet to be fully explored.

Against this general background, it is clear, too, that many publications on music are strongly linked with the development of Protestant schools – and also, naturally enough, with active confessional debates. In 1541, for example, Martin Agricola published *Ein Sangbuchlein aller Sontags Euangelien*, which is a simple, straightforward type of Lutheran hymn book (cf. Brinzing 2005). It contains a preface that discusses the usefulness of schools for the progress of the *artes* and of education in general, which will lead to proper religious teaching. This text cites a number of examples of eminent scholars and their feats of learning and erudition as being the fruit of good schooling:

> […] wo lernt man doch die sieben freien künste / darzu recht vnd künstlich Hebreisch / Grekisch / Lateinisch vnd Deudsch reden / Lesen / schreiben / singen / tichten etc.? In den Schulen. Wer zeigen vns armen madensecken / den Höchsten schatz / Gottes Wort / vnd seinen willen? Gott durch die künste. Wo sein herkommen alle treffliche gelerte leute / als Pythagoras / Homerus /

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

> Socrates / Plato / Cicero / Eras. Roterodamus / Martinus Lutherus / Philippus Melanchth. vnd alle andere? Aus den Schulen (Agricola [1541], A v^{v}).

A similar passage appears up again in a later publication by Agricola, entitled *Musica ex prioribus* (1547), which is a compilation of texts from other music treatises. Here, the preface exhorts parents to be sure to maintain schools, and to urge their children to go to school. But this time, the list of exemplary names is replaced by a strongly worded call to order: The social order is described as having been instituted by divine will, and the exhortation to this true and desirable type of order is accompanied by a general caution against the devil and all his works (Agricola 1547, A iiij^{r}). What is even more important, certain notable exponents of their own, Lutheran confession are criticized as having embraced error, as apostates even: "Ist es nicht immer schade das die trefflichen gelerten leute / als D. Philipp. Melanc. Doctor. Maior. Doctor Creutzinger vnd andere mehr / jtzund wie die verschüchterten schaffe inn der jrre gehen […]?" (Agricola 1547, A iiij^{v}–A v^{r}).

The members of the 'Philippist' faction during the Interim debates (Melanchthon, Georg Maior and Caspar Cruciger) are attacked from an orthodox Lutheran point of view (cf. also Wengert 1989). But the reworking illustrates, as well, the shifting balance between theological and professional aspects of the question. The educational system cannot, in the end, be separated from its social function and its spiritual aims. Here, the discourse on music shows apparent influences of the Interim conflicts, and Melanchthon's 'disappearance' is, of course, part of a broader development – which, to put the case in a vastly simplified way, would result in a separation between Melanchthon's theological and his educational *persona.* Later sixteenth-century German debates – even those relating to music – document that Melanchthon's impact on education remained much more evident than his theological contributions.

At the very same time, a resolutely Catholic statement was published by Heinrich Glarean in his *Dodekachordon* (1547), in which the author develops a new modal system, extending the medieval system of eight modes to twelve and presenting it as being derived from ancient Greek theory. The new system added types of modes that allowed Glarean to describe more recent scales. Up to there, it would constitute a purely technical innovation, concerning the system of music. But Glarean is nonetheless a very striking example of political-religious relations both within his own work and via his readers and recipients, through whom his ideas were further disseminated. He had a strongly Erasmian back-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

ground which explains in moderate reforms within the church in his early years; but he remained faithful to the Catholic church and felt threatened by the activity of 'ignorant' reformers who might endanger the development of humanist learning. Consequently, he took a clear decision for the Catholic side (Mahlmann-Bauer, forthcoming) and tried to reinforce the impact of his publication specifically by distributing it among a network of powerful Catholic representatives (Lütteken 1995 and Kölbl 2011). Personally, he was even to some extent a victim, as he felt forced to quit Basel when the city embraced the Reformation. Against this background, religious concerns in his other works become very plausible, especially in the *Dodekachordon*.

This book, which certainly is one of the most famous music treatises of the sixteenth century, was not intended merely as a work on music theory, but also as a strong polemical statement in defence of the Catholic practice of church music (chant and polyphony). Glarean combines three strains: a rational-intellectual, a religious, and a humanist strand, in order to present and define his unorthodox theory (Fuller 1996, 195 f.). He invokes the authority of the Roman Church to corroborate his theory, taking the modal system as a scientific fact to demonstrate that "both ancient Greek and traditional Christian practices […] must necessarily converge." (ibid., 196). Glarean has recourse to Erasmus's concept of *instauratio*, which Erasmus had introduced to justify his emendations of the New Testament: an act of *instauratio* as the reconstitution of the legitimate old status. In explaining his modal reform as an equally humanistic attempt at re-establishing the order which could be deduced from the ancient sources, he proposes an interpretation based squarely on ancient texts: there is an octave located on every one of the seven steps of the diatonic scale, which can be divided in two ways, consisting of a fifth below and a fourth above, or vice versa; only two of them are unusable (where a correct division is impossible). Glarean then intends to demonstrate the typical melodic and intervallic formulae that emerge from each mode, and gives examples from existing (often well-known) repertory. Thus, in the second book of the *Dodekachordon*, he presents a wide choice of current plainchant repertory in order to document in clear and empirical terms the existence of the different modes according to his system. His choices indicate a tendency towards some of the most fundamental biblical texts, such as the *Pater noster*, the words of the Annunciation, etc., with their Gregorian melodies. The importance of this kind of music with regard to faith is underlined at the end of the second book:

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

> I firmly believe that a simple song divided skilfully through the modes contributes very much to Christian piety, […] nor does it make only a slight contribution to our spiritual devotion (as we say now), especially songs of such kind as Ambrose established among the Italians, and also Gregory and Augustine […]. Then there have been notable men among the Gauls and Germans [like Hermannus Contractus, who] seems to me to have shown more musical genius in the Prosa about the Queen of Heaven [sc. 'Ave praeclara'] than the huge crowd of others in the innumerable wagonloads of songs. […] But I am so far from whishing church songs to die, that I declare firmly that nothing more complete has ever been created, since in it those composers have demonstrated […] learning, joined together with piety (*Dodekachordon* II, chap. 38, cf. Glarean 1965, 206 f.).

In the following paragraph, Glarean mentions the "adulterers and deceivers" of the Scriptures and also cites the "abuses of some men" who "abrogate wholly what has been instituted and consecrated in a true and pious way, as with sorrow we see happening in our times". This is a warning against the trend of contemporary developments, which are to be understood as the offspring of the Reformation as well (it is noticeable in other instances that he maintains a critical position against the Lutheran movement, not least because of the possible menaces for schooling and learning which are associated with it). The dedication printed with the book clearly emphasizes these intentions: the *Dodekachordon* is dedicated to Cardinal Otto Truchseß von Waldburg, the bishop of Augsburg, a powerful exponent of the Catholic hierarchy. Glarean invokes Otto's protection for his work, precisely because his *restitutio* of music theory may be misunderstood as *re-formatio* and *renovatio* and therefore might possibly earn him harsh criticism. It has recently been shown that Glarean in fact went even further, sending numerous copies of his book to strategically chosen Catholic representatives so as to place his work very precisely with influential persons who could act as supporters of his defence of Catholic musical practice (Kölbl 2011).

At first sight, however, exactly the opposite of Glarean's intention seems to occur, when the twelve-mode theory is later adopted by overtly Protestant authors. The twelve-mode system begins to appear in other theoretical writings of the 1570s or in music anthologies and collections, often arranged as a kind of demonstration of the different modes (Westendorf 1984, Miller 1961, Bossuyt 1981). The first known application in a motet collection was published in 1565, by a Catholic and disciple of Glarean, Homer Herpol of Fribourg; but for the later music collections as well as for books on music it is remarkable that – at least in Germany – the greater number of recipients of Glarean's writings is to be found

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

among Protestant authors and compilers. This may be surprising, but, as we shall see, the later authors were well able to intentionally ignore this implication and instead read the book as a humanistically informed work which represented a validated account of a core issue of music.

Protestant writers on music could take up the humanist argument of expurgation as well and use it in their sense: publications of liturgical repertory, if they included Latin chant, also recurred to untainted antiquity to justify their choice; and the defence of liturgical purity was a welcome argument for Lutherans to demonstrate their acceptance of the Peace of Augsburg or the interest in confessional unification in the following decades. In addition to the importance of 'incorrupt' chant repertory, possible connections also exist between the motet collections and the tradition of Postilles (Westendorf 1984, 33). A case in point is Lucas Lossius (1510–1582), who studied in Leipzig and Wittenberg, left university without having graduated, but well equipped with letters of recommendation by Luther, Melanchthon and Bugenhagen. He became secretary of Urbanus Rhegius in Lüneburg and later on teacher at the Johanneum in this town and published in different fields, mostly schoolbooks (for an extensive list of works, cf. Onkelbach 1960, 269–319). Lossius's *Psalmodia, hoc est Cantica sacra veteris ecclesiae selecta* (Nuremberg 1553) contains a preface by Philipp Melanchthon expounding the reformer's ideas on religious music. Its main concern should be retained for the following discussions:

> The instinct for Music implanted in the human mind, and the ability to distinguish sounds, is a singular gift of God. […] How shall we make sense of the fact that our spirits are wounded by these motions of the air? We must recognise them as works of God, even if we cannot understand exactly how they happen, and we should praise God, who has implanted this sense for Music in the nature of humans for the sake of his great plan. […] the principle cause of music is so that divine doctrine may be comprehended by song and propagated more widely and conserved for longer[.] Our ears are drawn to song, and delightful harmonies penetrate deeper into our minds and cling more tenaciously in our memory [Transl. by Grantley McDonald].

Music thus acts as a reinforcement of religious teaching. Melanchthon expressed this very point in several widely circulated prefaces to printed music collections, especially those published by Georg Rhau in Wittenberg. A generation later, in 1588, Franz Eler published a similar liturgical collection, the *Cantica selecta veteris ecclesiae selecta.* Eler was a former Rostock student (Eler 2002, 9*), and hence had studied with teachers who had strong connections with Melanchthon. In the *Cantica* he includes a

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

prefatory letter by one of Melanchthon's pupils, David Chytraeus (1530–1600), serving the same purpose: to ensure theological approval and justification of the musical contents. A second, shorter dedication by the compiler, Eler, presents this collection as a unification and a confirmation of the local repertory. The book consists of two parts, a Latin section with Gregorian chants, and a second section with new German-texted chants and chorales by Luther and other contemporary authors. Here we encounter Glarean's theory again: for, as the title page states, both parts of the book are announced as having been 'accommodated to Glarean's doctrine of the 12 modes' (although the title page states, in addition, that they have been taken from the repertory of the Old Church).

The author thus wishes to camouflage the novelty of recent Protestant music by a double argument: by declaring it as a part of the authentic tradition, and also by subjecting it to the latest theoretical system. When Glarean claimed that he had demonstrated the correct modes for Gregorian chant, he offered a system of tonality approved by historical research and humanist interpretation. If now someone else took up this system and applied it to other music, this would mean a transfer of the authority of the antique modes to another repertory: in Eler's case, the more recent German chants and lieder like those composed by Luther. That genre of music, which most explicitly could transport a confessional connotation, is put on a par with Gregorian chant and Latin polyphony by the connection with a modern theory that claimed to be universal.

Chytraeus's preface to the *Cantica* illustrates this connection further. His first sentences closely reflect the above-mentioned formulations by Melanchthon on the function of music – with the central point that contents which are expressed in 'numbers' (that is, in versified form and poetic language, with music) are better memorized, touch the listener more deeply, and are disseminated more easily. In what follows, he turns to the twelve modes: Chytraeus praises Eler for applying these modes and for classifying the chants. Finally, he complains of their general neglect, whilst, on the contrary, they were most necessary for musicians to know, since they were intimately linked with the expressivity of the melodies. We may deduce from this the central points of Chytraeus's thought on music. His theological ideas on the purpose of music (that is, sacred music) are in a clearly Melanchthonian vein, proposing that music is able to strengthen the impact of texts. He adopts the system of the modes according to Glarean, and stresses the affective qualities of the modes. Chytraeus thus underlines the theological uses of music and the importance of

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

following the 'right' theory that governs the workings and effectiveness of the whole system. Nevertheless, he pointedly does *not* name Glarean, even if his name had already appeared so prominently on the title page.

Gallus Dressler provides us with an exemplary case of a musician and author with a Wittenberg-style education. He has been cited on several occasions as a striking example of a Melanchthonian or even a 'Philippist' musician, not least because it has become obvious that, even beyond his school education, he also chose to be associated with a theological faction (Heidrich 2005). He had strong ties to Philippist circles, as he studied at the University of Jena (c. 1557/1558; he took a master's degree at Wittenberg only in 1570) and became Martin Agricola's successor at Magdeburg. The fact that in 1575 he left Magdeburg for Zerbst (where he became a deacon) seems another strong indication that Dressler probably preferred an environment that adhered to Philippist positions. Magdeburg was well known as a stronghold for the Gnesiolutherans, with such eminent figures as Mathias Flacius Illyricus (who left the city in 1557), Nikolaus von Amsdorff, Erasmus Alber and Nicolaus Gallus – but in this city, Dressler (as also a number of his teacher colleagues) did however support the Wittenberg-based Philippists, maintained good contacts there, and even criticized the orthodox party.

His confessional inclinations can be deduced particularly from the choice of texts in his printed works. He published a number of pedagogical tracts and music collections; his writings are known above all for their interest in 'musica poetica' and in the use of the twelve-mode system: his *Praecepta musicae poeticae* (1563) present a thorough discussion of musical composition, his other texts emphasize the modes. Remarkably, even his first pedagogical text on music is exclusively devoted to the modes: *Practica modorum explicatio*, which appeared in Jena in 1561 (Dressler 2000). Here he adopts the concise way of describing the octave species and mentions Glarean's achievements favourably, but he restricts his treatment to the eight 'old' modes in common use. His later treatise, the *Elementa* (1571), takes up the complete twelve mode system and expresses his indebtedness to Glarean's model, evoking his own earlier reduced presentation. Dressler, did not, however, work with the *Dodekachordon* itself, but rather with the abridged version of it, the *Epitome* (published by Glarean's stepson with the author's collaboration in 1557 and 1559), as can be recognized from some textual details.[3] The *Epitome* was intended

3 For example, in the *Epitome*, Glarean compares the basic entities "oratio", "argu-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

as a vehicle for the wider circulation of Glarean's ideas. It was a cheaper volume than the *Dodekachordon*, in a more handy octavo format, and offered a brief overall account of the system of music and an introduction to mensural notation, with a condensed introduction to Glarean's modal theory (Groote, forthcoming). For the modes, no longer polyphonic examples are included, yet only chant melodies – this is by far the most important difference in comparison with the *Dodekachordon*; but the connections of each mode with its affective quality are still discussed.

Thus, we can observe that Dressler may well have been attracted by the systematic discussion and fundamental issues of Glarean's theory, like so many other authors who had enjoyed a Melanchthonian pedagogical education, many of whom seem to have been especially inclined to accept this theory as a new scientific standard. Glarean nevertheless maintained his anti-Protestant criticism and stance in the preface to the *Epitome:* the demon has sent evil spirits who have possessed men, so that, under the pretext of adhering to the Gospel, they have banned the heavenly songs from the churches (Glarean 1559, fol. †3^{r}). This menace consisted from Glarean's point of view mainly in the abandoning of polyphonic practice of every kind of music by the Reformed groups in Switzerland. But a Lutheran reader after, say, the middle of the century would most probably be able to subscribe to such a view as well, since they had similar experiences in their direct controversies with the Calvinists or other strict reformed communities.

The typical textbook layout and structure, as present in Glarean's *Epitome* and the other propaedeutic and pedagogical writings, could be easily adapted to other choices of repertory as well. The exposition of the structure of each mode is often combined with a few remarks on its expressive character and qualities (sad, mournful, joyful, etc.) and a few music examples – here the 'original' Gregorian examples from Glarean's book could easily be interchanged with other musical repertoire. Dressler limits his examples to intonations since he remains focused on the eight modes generally in use. In this procedure, the neutralization of the original intention becomes more and more evident: the theoretical demonstration can in fact be based equally on German chorales, or even on secular songs. This tendency can be observed, too, in the writings of the Rostock professor and educator David Chytraeus, who combines a short account of music history, including a systematic overview of the

mentatio" and "modus" in grammar, dialectics and music, since they fulfil a similar function within each discipline – this recurs in Dressler's introduction.

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

uses and functions of music, with an introduction to the twelve-mode system, where he recommends Glarean explicitly as a benchmark author.

Chytraeus's examples for the modes are rich, diverse and well selected, combining chant repertory (including even references to Protestant 'corrected' versions such as those by Hermannus Bonnus), vernacular Lutheran songs and polyphony. But among the polyphonic pieces he mentions, Chytraeus retains only a few of the most famous names that would have occured in Glarean (such as that of Josquin) and then combines them with more recent repertory (Meiland, Clemens non Papa, Orlando di Lasso). In the 1580s, in the chapter on music in Johannes Freigius' *Paedagogus* (Basel 1582; the chapter is actually authored by Conradus Stuberus), sacred and secular examples are combined. The *Paedagogus* is an encyclopedic introduction to all disciplines, but is intended rather for private study than as a formal textbook. Here, the reader can find extracts from Utendal's psalm collection, the setting of the Credo, *Wir glauben all an einen Gott*, first published in the *Geystliche gesangk Büchleyn* of 1524 (for the Dorian mode), or *Bewahr mich Herr* (for the Hypoionian), alongside German songs by Ludwig Senfl, Georg Forster or Caspar Othmayr, such as *Ach meidlein fein*, *Im bad wir woellen froelich sein*, or *Ach gott wie wehe thut scheiden* (Freig 1983, 89). As in Lossius's example, this kind of treatment and discussion extends the validity and application of the twelve-mode system to all genres and types of music.

This amounts to admitting that Glarean himself had initiated this path, but had avoided making a direct connection between the confessional intentions of the *Dodekachordon* and the wider applicability of his system. In the *Dodekachordon*, he pointedly did not present any German repertory, using only two 'disguised' examples in Latin translation, Adam von Fulda's *Ach hülf mich leid* (with the religious hymn text *O vera lux et gloria*), and the anonymous *Aus Herzens Grund* (with the new text *A furore tuo*). In an exactly contemporary pamphlet that enjoyed a wide public circulation, disseminating a political song in honour of Charles V after his victory against the Schmalkaldic league in 1547 (*Kain gwalt uff diser erd*), Glarean nevertheless ascribes a clear modal identity to the German tune (*Mag ich unglück*, a well-known *Tenorlied* melody) and also includes a Latin translation of the German text of the political song in accentual-syllabic verse (Groote 2010). This can be interpreted as a kind of reciprocal justification and authorization: the fact that a well-known German song is in the Hypoaeolian mode (that is, one of the new modes) makes the existence of the new modal species all the more probable, hence justifiable as a category; and further-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

more, if the 'learned' modal system can be applied to 'popular' vernacular songs, it means that they are ranked more or less on an equal level with Latin-texted music (Chytraeus, as it happens, also used *Mag ich unglück* as an example of the Hypoaeolian). This kind of 'strategic' confessional approach, so prominent in the *Dodekachordon*, is however set aside for a different purpose.

It seems plausible to claim that it was attractive for later authors to accept Glarean's system above all because it was valued as the scientifically correct one, as a model which greatly helped to explain musical structure as it had developed over the course of time. If, in other fields, a shift happened from clearly confessional terrain towards the field of aesthetics, it can be argued that the reception history of the twelve modes presents an analogous case – which is to say that the strong links existing between the modes, on the one hand, and the affections or passions they were expected to arouse, on the other, touches on an absolutely central issue of the power of music in general. An important nexus of ideas here is the function of music as a means to devotion and thus to emotional participation, even in a much broader cultural sense. Many instances in the broad sixteenth-century discourse on music attest to a renewed interest in the 'psychagogic' and expressive forces of music: music is considered as a strong means to stir, to arouse or to soothe the passions. This was of pivotal interest, because it offered a perfect point of connection for discussing the utility of music for religious instruction, for devotion or for public worship, and thus remained a crucial argument in favour of music and musical practice in general. Christoph Praetorius opens his *Erotemata musices in usum scholae Luneburgensis* (1574) with a declaration of precisely this point. Music is no longer considered a solely religious practice, but described as a pleasure that helps to recreate one's spirit:

> Artem musicam magnam habere vim & gratiam in afficiendis animis humanis, & in Ecclesia Dei semper usitatam fuisse, non est dubium. Nam & sonis & numeris suis mentes mirè delectat & variis motibus suaviter afficit, & in usum eius fuisse non solum in Ecclesia Dei, & veteris & novi Testamenti, sed etiam in Ethnicis congressibus sacris, & ludis, exempla multa & lyrica carmina testantur […] Ita autem discere hanc artem pueri debent, vt […] exercitio Musico, publicè & priuatim psallendo animos ad pietatem, & virtutem excitent, & fatigari discendi stuio, ac cogitandi labore, suauissima oblectatione suo loco & tempore se recreent […] Musica enim tanquam condimentum grauioribus studijs aspergitur, ne ingenia animorum perpetua contentione frangantur, aut debilitentur (Praetorius 1574, n. pag.)

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

The various religious overtones may have been gradually more neglected or attenuated as time went on, but the outcomes of the intensive confessional debates of the first half of the sixteenth century provided a solid basis for concentrating future theoretical discussion on intrinsically musical values. This can be seen for example in Philipp Dulichius's motet collections (*Novum opus musicum* 1595 and *Fasciculus novus* 1598), as well. Dulichius was a Kantor in Stettin and Danzig, and can be described as a 'late Philippist', who documented his attachment to Melanchthon at different points in his life and probably intended to avoid having to accept the Formula of Concord by his move to Danzig (Steuber 2003, Crusius 2008). He places a reference to Glarean's system prominently on the title page of his motet prints and comments on this fact in the preface, though with rather different points of emphasis from Eler / Chytraeus: Dulichius insists, as we might expect, on the expressive and effectual power of music, which can only be ensured by the correct usage of modality. But his arguments stress more strongly the necessity of accommodating text and music and of keeping a special focus on the possible effects of music on the listeners, thereby tending towards more obviously aesthetic considerations.

4. Conclusion

It has become evident that the preceding analyses produce, in the end, more problems than they resolve. Such a process of reflection results in the further recognition that this situation derives clearly from the great diversity of circumstances, of trajectories and careers, but also from the resistance of the works to analysis, or from the limits of theoretical discourse itself. It also results, without doubt, from long-enshrined musicological habits and conventions. There is no revisionist programme in this assertion, but rather a desire to re-establish the nature of the historical and situational problems in all their (very real) complexity.

From its beginnings in the nineteenth century, musicology has continued to accept – without ever properly critiquing or questioning – the established paradigm of confessional allegiance and the framework of the Catholic-Protestant divide. This early habit reflected the social and professional situation of many early musicologists. Traces of just these kinds of situations are found especially in such music histories (of which a conspicuous number appeared in Germany in those years) that were written

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

by authors who sought explicitly to link the Reformation with nationalist agendas and interpretations.

The music historian Franz Brendel, for example, postulated in the mid-nineteenth century a pivotal role for the Reformation in the historical development of German music; Carl von Winterfeld aimed at establishing the figure of Johannes Eccard as a true "Prussian Palestrina", so as to allow the construction of a music history with a far greater degree of independence from the Roman centre; and on this foundation, Philipp Spitta could then present Johann Sebastian Bach, the "Lutheran arch-cantor", as the culminating point of this historical narrative (Lütteken 2007, 63 f.). Spitta himself tried to initiate a movement of renewal for Protestant church music and discussed in 1894 in an article entitled "Palestrina im sechzehnten und neunzehnten Jahrhundert" the question of Catholic restoration movements in music from the Counter-Reformation era to the era of nineteenth-century Caecilianism (Sandberger 1996, 89–115). Even a relatively minor figure such as the composer Philipp Dulichius could then be labelled a "Pomeranian Lassus" (this is the title of an article published by Rudolf Schwartz in 1896). In France, by contrast, the history of music takes a resolutely Catholic turn, as has been clearly shown by Katherine Ellis (2005, and Vendrix 2004). In the hands of authors, many of whom have a strong degree of religious engagement, almost all of them ranged under the banner of Solesmes; musical history (or more exactly, music historiography) saw Protestantism simply as a temporary aberration, rather than as an integral and formative part of musical culture. But whether we are considering the German or the French tradition, they both result in exactly the same kind of approach, essentially constructed around a framework of dualities. There are no grey areas, no nuances or contradictions – or at least, such contradicitions occur only as the result of deception or dissimulation. It would have been impossible to claim (for example) that a composer would have 'forgotten' his faith, or neglected his confessional allegiance. And so, in insisting strongly on these kinds of dualities in regard to behaviour or attitude, such histories forced and skewed both analytical readings of works, on the one hand, and interpretations of biographical trajectories and personal factors, on the other.

Musical works themselves may seem to tolerate no ambiguity. But we need to approach such questions with caution. A quotation appears to be a clear admission: Verdelot reveals his Savonarolan sympathies in quoting a short extract from a *lauda*. Why (we might ask) might he not simply have acted from musical preference or inclination? A melody may be at-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

tractive for its own sake, for its melodic contours and turns of phrase, or for the way it fits into a contrapuntal texture. It is hardly necessary to see in it a confessional declaration of faith, above all in a period when there was absolutely no obligation to register one's civil and religious status. In similar fashion, the stance of Ludwig Daser and of his second patron, the duke of Württemberg, is not easily reconcilable with traditional musical historiography. To have left a splendid, established musical chapel – that of the dukes of Bavaria, in Munich – for another that was undoubtedly also attractive and interesting, if still developing, under the aegis of a Protestant prince, disturbs our understanding of the relevant social and professional categories. Tolerance – whether sincere, or calculated, since it was to be seen as positive on the political level – is difficult to accommodate within the traditional framework of musical historiography.

The question of belief, of the allegiances and expression of faith, and of religious identity, remains a thorny matter. But it acquires an even greater fascination as soon as we make the attempt to see it afresh in all its rich ambiguity, and to restore it in its full reality, as a phenomenon of immense human and ideological complexity.

Texts cited

Primary Sources

Agricola, Martin [1541]: *Ein Sangbuchlein aller Sontags Euangelien. Eine kurtze Deudsche Leyen Musica* […]. Magdeburg.

Bächtold, Jakob (ed.) (1878): *Niklaus Manuel.* Frauenfeld: Huber (= Bibliothek älterer Schriftwerke der deutschen Schweiz und ihres Grenzgebietes, 2).

Chytraeus, David (1595): *De ratione discendi. Ad regulas studiorum appendix, continens paraleipómena, quae cum priori editione coniuncta, enkyklopaideian integram absoluunt.* Jena: Steinmann.

Consilia theologica Witebergensia, d.i. Wittenbergische geistliche Rathschläge […] *Martini Lutheri, seiner Collegen und treuen Nachfolger* […] *zusammengebracht und abgefertigt von der theologischen Facultät daselbsten* (1664). Bd. 3: *Consiliorum und responsorum theologicorum Wittenbergensium: betreffendt allerhand Moral- und Policey-Sachen.* Frankfurt a.M.: Endtner u. Wolffgang.

Dressler, Gallus (1575): *Musicae practicae elementa.* Magdeburg: Kirchner.

Dressler, Gallus (2000): *Practica modorum explicatio. Explication pratique des modes.* Ed. by Olivier Trachier. Conflans-Sainte-Honorine: R.I.T.M. (= Éditions R.I.T.M., 3).

Eler, Franz (ed.) ([1588] 2002): *Cantica sacra.* Introduction by Klaus Beckmann. Hildesheim et al.: Olms. [Reprint of Hamburg, Wolff].

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

Freig, Thomas (1983): *Paedagogus 1582. The Chapter on Music.* Ed. by Jeremy Yudkin. Neuhausen-Stuttgart: American Institute of Musicology (= Musicological Studies and Documents, 38).
Glarean, Heinrich (1559): *Musicae epitome ex Glareani Dodecachordo.* Basel: Petri.
Glarean, Heinrich (1965): *Dodecachordon.* Translation, transcription and comment by Clement A. Miller. Rome: American Institute of Musicology (= Musicological Studies and Documents, 6).
L'Estocart, Paschal de ([1582] 2004): *Sacrae cantiones.* Ed. by Cœurdevey, Annie / Besson, Vincent. Turnhout: Brepols.
Lotter, Agricola (1547): *Musica ex prioribus a me aeditis musicis, excerpta, pro primisq[ue] Parthenopolitanæ Scholæ, Tyronibus digesta.* Magdeburg: Lotter.
Praetorius, Christoph (1574): *Erotemata musices in usum scholae lunaeburgensis.* Wittenbert: Schwertel.
Praetorius, Michael (1615): *Syntagma musicum, tomus primus.* Wittenberg: Richter.
Reinhart, Martin (1524): *Underrichte, wie sich ein frummer Christ bey den papistischen Messen, so yetz noch vil gehalten werden (wenn er sich mit gutten Fug nit absundern kan) halten sol, das er sich nit versünde und die Zeit unnütz verliere.* [Nürnberg].

Secondary Sources

Barge, Hermann (1905): *Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt.* Leipzig: Brandstetter.
Bossuyt, Ignace (1981): "Die 'Psalmi poenitentiales' (1570) des Alexander Utendal", in: *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 38, 279–295.
Breuer, Dieter (1999): "Konversionen im konfessionellen Zeitalter", in: Niewöhner, Friedrich / Rädle, Fidel (eds.): *Konversionen im Mittelalter und in der frühen Neuzeit.* Hildesheim (= *Hildesheimer Forschungen*, 1), 59–69.
Brinzing, Armin (2005): "Martin Agricola als Schulmann und Komponist", in: Wollny, Peter (ed.): *Musikgeschichte im Zeichen der Reformation.* Beeskow: Ortus (= *Jahrbuch der Ständigen Konferenz Mitteldeutsche Barockmusik*), 171–188
Cazaux, Christelle (2002): *La Musique à la cour de François Ier.* Paris: École des Chartes – Programme "Ricercar".
Cœurdevey, Annie (2003): *Roland de Lassus.* Paris: Fayard.
Crusius, Irene (2008): "'Nicht calvinisch, nicht lutherisch': Zu Humanismus, Philippismus und Kryptocalvinismus in Sachsen am Ende des 16. Jahrhunderts", in: *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 99, 139–174.
Dean, Jeffrey (1986): "The occasion of Compère's *Sola caret monstris:* a study in historical interpretation", in: *Musica Disciplina*, 40, 99–133.
Dunning, Albert (1970): *Die Staatsmotette, 1480–1555.* Utrecht: Oosthoek.
Ellis, Katharine (2004): "Palestrina et la musique dite 'palestrinienne' en France au XIX^e siècle : questions d'exécution et de réception", in: Vendrix, Philippe (ed.): *La Renaissance et sa musique au XIX^e siècle.* Paris: Klincksieck, 151–184.

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

Ellis, Katharine (2005): *Interpreting the Musical Past. Early Music in Nineteenth-Century France.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
Fontana, Bartolomeo (1889–1899): *Renata di Francia, duchessa di Ferrara*. 3 vols. Roma: Forzani.
Freedman, Richard (2000): *The Chansons of Orlando di Lasso. Music, Piety, and Print in Sixteenth-Century France.* Rochester: University of Rochester Press.
Fuller, Sarah (1996): "Defending the *Dodecachordon:* Ideological Currents in Glarean's Modal Theory", in: *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 49, 191–224.
Gargiulo, Piero (2001): "Ancora su Verdelot-Savonarola: il madrigale *Con lacrim'et sospir*", in: *Rivista Italiana di Musicologia*, 36, 199–225.
Groote, Inga Mai (2010): "'Kain gwalt vff dieser erd' als hypoaeolische lateinische Ode: Eine unbeachtete Sprachpolemik Heinrich Glareans", in: *Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance* 72, 397–401.
Groote, Inga Mai: "Studying music and arithmetic with Glarean: Contextualising the 'Epitome' and 'Annotationes' with the sources of Glarean's teaching", in: Fenlon, Iain / Groote, Inga Mai (eds.): *Heinrich Glarean's Books: The Intellectual World of a Musical Humanist.* Cambridge [forthcoming].
Gürsching, Heinrich (1950): "Leonhard Paminger", in: *Zeitschrift für bayerische Kirchengeschichte* 19, 122 f.
Handy, Isabelle (2008): *Musiciens au temps des derniers Valois* (1547–1589). Paris: Champion.
Harrán, Don (2003): *Salomone Rossi.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
Heidrich, Jürgen (2005): "Bemerkungen zum geistlichen Umfeld der 'Cantiones sacrae' Gallus Dresslers von 1565", in: Wollny, Peter (ed.): *Musikgeschichte im Zeichen der Reformation.* Beeskow: Ortus (= *Jahrbuch der Ständigen Konferenz Mitteldeutsche Barockmusik*), 189–196.
His, Isabelle (2000): *Claude Le Jeune (v. 1530–1600). Un compositeur entre Renaissance et baroque.* Arles: Actes Sud.
Irwin, Joyce (1983): "Music and the Doctrine of Adiaphora in Orthodox Lutheran Theology", in: *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 14, 157–172.
Jas, Eric (ed.) (2005): *Beyond Contemporary Fame. Reassessing the Art of Clemens non Papa and Thomas Crecquillon.* Turnhout: Brepols.
Kölbl, Bernhard (2011): *Autorität der Autorschaft. Heinrich Glarean als Vermittler seiner Musiktheorie.* Diss. LMU München.
Leaver, Robin (2007): *Luther's Liturgical Music. Principles and Implications.* Grand Rapids: Eerdman.
Lindmayr-Brandl, Andrea (2005): "Neuer Glaube gegen Alte Macht. Spuren der Reformation im Salzburger Musikleben des 16. Jahrhunderts", in: Wollny, Peter (ed): *Musikgeschichte im Zeichen der Reformation.* Beeskow: Ortus (= *Jahrbuch der Ständigen Konferenz Mitteldeutsche Barockmusik*), 87–95.
Luther, Wilhelm Martin (1945): *Gallus Dressler. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte des protestantischen Schulkantorats im 16. Jahrhundert.* Kassel: Bärenreiter (= Göttinger Musikwissenschaftliche Arbeiten, 1).
Lütteken, Laurenz (1995): "Humanismus im Kloster. Bemerkungen zu einem der Dedikationsexemplare von Glareans *Dodekachordon*", in: Lütteken, Lau-

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

renz / Beer, Axel. Tutzing: Schneider (eds.): *Festschrift Klaus Hortschansky zum 60. Geburtstag*, 43–57.
Lütteken, Laurenz (2007): "Patronage und Reformation: Johann Walter und die Folgen", in Heidrich, Jürgen / Konrad, Ulrich (eds.): *Traditionen in der mitteldeutschen Musik des 16. Jahrhunderts. Symposiumsbericht Göttingen 1997.* Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 63–74.
Mahlmann-Bauer, Barbara: "Sympathies with Luther / Preferences for the Roman Church. Glarean's annotations as a mirror of his intellectual development", in: Fenlon, Iain / Groote, Inga Mai (eds.): *Heinrich Glarean's Books: The Intellectual World of a Musical Humanist.* Cambridge [forthcoming].
Marcus, Kenneth H. (2000): "A Veritable Break with the Past: Sacred Music in Fifteenth-Century Basel", in: *Medieval Germany. Associations and Delineations.* Ed. by Nancy van Deusen. Ottawa (= The Institute of Mediaeval Music, Musicological Studies LXII/5), 163–172.
Miller, Clement A. (1961): "The *Dodecachordon:* Its Origins and Influence on Renaissance Musical Thought", in: *Musica disciplina* 15, 156–166.
Niemöller, Klaus Wolfgang (1969): *Untersuchungen zu Musikpflege und Musikunterricht an den deutschen Lateinschulen vom ausgehenden Mittelalter bis um 1600.* Regensburg: Bosse (= Kölner Beiträge zur Musikforschung, 54).
Nugent, George (1990): "Anti-Protestant Music for Sixteenth-Century Ferrara", in: *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 43, 228–291.
Onkelbach, Friedhelm (1960): *Lucas Lossius und seine Musiklehre.* Regensburg: Bosse (= Kölner Beiträge zur Musikforschung, 17).
Pettegree, Andrew (2005): *The Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Pietschmann, Klaus (2006): "Zum konfessionellen Ausdrucks- und Konfliktpotential in der Musik der Reformation", in: Wollny, Peter (ed.): *Jahrbuch der Ständigen Konferenz Mitteldeutscher Barockmusik.* Beeskow: Ortus (= Jahrbuch der Ständigen Konferenz Mitteldeutsche Barockmusik), 23–33.
Sandberger, Wolfgang (1979): *Das Bach-Bild Philipp Spittas. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Bach-Rezeption im 19. Jahrhundert.* Stuttgart: Steiner (= Beihefte zum Archiv für Musikwissenschaft, 39).
Schmid, Ernst Fritz (1962): *Musik an den schwäbischen Zollernhöfen der Renaissance. Beiträge zur Kulturgeschichte des deutschen Südwestens.* Kassel etc.: Bärenreiter.
Steuber, Otfried von (2003): *Philipp Dulichius. Leben und Werk.* Kassel: Bärenreiter (= Marburger Beiträge zur Musikwissenschaft, 10).
Vendrix, Philippe (1999): *La Musique à la Renaissance.* Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
Vendrix, Philippe (2004): "'La musique montait, cette lune de l'art!'. Redécouvertes des musiques de la Renaissance à l'ère romantique", in: Vendrix, Philippe (ed.): *La Renaissance et sa musique au XIX^e siècle.* Paris: Klincksieck, 9–56.
Vendrix, Philippe (ed.) (2011): *Renaissance, Reformation, Counter-Reformation.* Aldershot: Ashgate.
Volland, Frauke (2003): "Konfession, Konversion und soziales Drama. Ein Plädoyer für die Ablösung des Paradigmas der 'konfessionellen Identität'", in:

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45

von Greyerz, Kaspar et al. (eds.): *Interkonfessionalität – Transkonfessionalität – binnenkonfessionelle Pluralität. Neue Forschungen zur Konfessionalisierungsthese.* Heidelberg (= Schriften des Vereins für Reformationsgeschichte, 201), 91–104.

Wengert, Timothy (1989): "Caspar Cruciger, 1504–1548: The Case of the Disappearing Reformer", in: *Sixteenth Century Journal* 20, 417–441.

Westendorf, Craig A. (1984): "Glareanus' *Dodecachordon* in German Theory and Practice. An Expression of Confessionalism"; in: *Current Musicology* 37/38, 33–48.

Bereitgestellt von | UZH Hauptbibliothek / Zentralbibliothek Zürich
Angemeldet | 130.60.47.84
Heruntergeladen am | 08.01.13 13:45